

dent to man's nature and would exist were there no supernatural elevation and no fall from it by our first parent. Even in paradise man would be tired and might yield to some form of covetousness so far as we know, though we do not know much about what might have been if Adam had not lapsed from his high estate. At least we are safe in a natural history of a national crime.

JOHN RICKABY, S. J.

Stonyhurst, England.

THE RESTORATION OF GREGORIAN CHANT.

IN HIS letter dated the Feast of the Immaculate Conception, 1903, and addressed to the Cardinal Vicar of Rome, His Holiness Pope Pius X. writes: "Now that so much study has been employed by distinguished men in illustrating the liturgy and the art used in the service of public worship, that such consoling and not unfrequently such splendid results have been attained in so many churches throughout the world in the restoration of sacred music, notwithstanding the very serious difficulties that had to be faced, and that have been so happily overcome, now in fine, that the necessity of a complete change in the order of things has come to be universally appreciated, every abuse in this matter becomes intolerable and must be removed." From these words of the Holy Father it is evident that the movement for the propagation of true ecclesiastical music, to which he has deigned to lend his powerful support, had already attained considerable proportions before the advent of the present Pontificate, and that the "Motu Proprio" of November last was, therefore, anything but a *fulminatio de caelis*.

While comparatively little of the "study employed in illustrating the liturgy and the art used in the service of public worship" can be ascribed to America, yet even here the signs of the times did not escape observation altogether. Hence it was that in the autumn of 1902 the writer of this article had the good fortune of being sent by his venerable ordinary on a musical tour through Europe, receiving instructions to visit the various churches most renowned for their music, and particularly to make a study of the various schools of Gregorian chant with a view of adopting the best prevailing methods at the seminary of the diocese. The hope that an account of the experiences of this tour may prove, if not instructive, at least not lacking in interest, must serve as an apology for the present somewhat personal essay.

In the course of this article we shall frequently have occasion to speak of the various theories on Gregorian chant, particularly in reference to its rhythm. In order that in such cases we may be more clearly understood, we deem it well, before proceeding, to make some preliminary remarks on the history of this style of music.

Gregorian chant, as is well known, is the musical art product of the first ten centuries of the Christian era. Compared with modern music it differs in many points, chiefly, however, in this, that its rhythm is not metrical or strict, but free, like the rhythm of prose. Now it is precisely this peculiar rhythm which occasioned the manifold vicissitudes that plain chant has had to undergo. As early as the tenth century a decline in the right understanding of this rhythm began to show itself. This was particularly true in the case of the long melisms of the graduals, whence the rise of the sequence-form which resolved these long neumes into a chant almost exclusively syllabic. With the more enthusiastic cultivation of polyphony the rhythm of Gregorian suffered more and more, until finally, in the fifteenth century, it had become one of the lost arts. The beautiful melisms, exquisitely wrought and intended for delicate and lightsome execution, were now sung in long and ponderous tones, without any attention to the grouping of the notes—a matter so essential to the proper rendering of Gregorian song. No wonder, then, that a need was at length felt of abbreviating what had become unending, formless exercises in vocalization. In Italy the great Palestrina himself undertook the task of a reform. His effort, it is true, proved abortive, as he never completed the work he began, and even what he did accomplish we can now say with almost absolute certainty never reached the hands of the publisher. The disciples of Palestrina were, however, more successful in the pseudo-reformation, and the result of their labors is what is known as the *Medicean Gradual*.

While the intentions of the reformers of Gregorian in the sixteenth century cannot well be impugned, inasmuch as it was their object to give to the chant a form better accommodated to the prevailing method of execution, yet their work was certainly not a reform in the sense of the Council of Trent, in which case they would have acted on the admonition of Charlemagne to the singers of his time: "Revertimini ad fontes Sancti Gregorii." As it was, the Gregorian reform of the sixteenth century was merely a makeshift, one that was quite inadequate to rescue the chant from the almost universal contempt into which it afterward fell.

About the middle of the last century an unusual amount of interest was displayed in the study and cultivation of Gregorian. The question of rhythm especially received attention, and various divergent theories were advanced. Père Lambilotte believed that he had

found evidences in the manuscripts to show that the rhythm of plain chant was really metrical. Since then this same idea has more or less fascinated such men as Houdard, Lhoumeau, Lutschounigg and the Jesuit Dechevrens. Amongst those who stood for the free rhythm of Gregorian there arose two distinct schools, one of which has gradually become to be known as the school of Ratisbon, the other the school of Solesmes. Historically viewed, these two schools represent respectively the Gregorian of the Renaissance and that of the Middle Ages down as far as the beginning of the eleventh century. While both the school of Ratisbon and that of Solesmes are perfectly agreed on the fundamental principle, "Sing the words with notes as you would speak them without notes," yet their several interpretations of this principle have carried them widely apart. In both schools the tonic accent is considered the most essential element of free rhythm. But what is the nature of this accent? The history of language tells us that originally the tonic or acute accent was exclusively a musical one, designating neither stress nor length, but merely an elevation of the voice. In the Latin language, however, particularly during the third and fourth centuries, this accent brought with it the additional idea of intensity, while long accents appeared only with the Romance languages, of which they were really the cause. Now, while the Solesmes school insists on the accent of Latin as spoken during the ages in which the Gregorian melodies originated, and, therefore, as designating not length but merely stress, the school of Ratisbon, following a practice dating back as far as the fifteenth century, marks each accented syllable with a tailed note, assigning to it a time value approximately one-half greater than that of unaccented syllables. And yet, despite this difference in the apprehension of the nature of the tonic accent, the two schools might readily have made a compromise in selections purely syllabic.

Far greater is the divergence of the two schools as regards the rendering of the pneumatic chant. According to the teaching of Guido of Arezzo, "In harmonia (melody) sunt soni, quorum unus, duo vel tres aptantur in syllabas, ipsaeque solae vel duplicatae neumam, i. e. partem constituunt cantilena; sed pars una vel plures distinctionem faciunt, i. e., congruum respirationis locum." (Microlog. 15.) While this doctrine may not be of absolute necessity in syllabic chant, as the proper declamation of the text is here frequently a sufficient guide; for the right rendering of the more elaborate compositions it is of the utmost importance. Without due attention to the rhythmical articulation of the melody the delicate symmetry which constitutes the chief grace of Gregorian is lost, and particularly the long melisms become both meaningless and difficult of

execution. To have called the attention of the world once more to all this is by no means the least of the services the school of Solesmes has rendered to the traditional chant.

In the school of Ratisbon there has been but little regard for this nice balancing of parts. And indeed it could not well have been otherwise, for the reason that the authors of the curtailed edition of the chant, of which that school has made use almost exclusively, had destroyed, albeit unconsciously, nearly every vestige of this symmetry.

Having thus given a brief sketch of Gregorian in its various phases, we now return to the principal object of this article, which is, as has been indicated before, an account of the writer's personal observations while in the pursuance of musical studies in Europe.

As the interest of the writer was concentrated in a great degree on the work of ecclesiastical seminaries—it being his desire to learn just how much could be done for the advancement of church music in such institutions—his first visit was paid to Oscott College, the diocesan seminary of Birmingham. The music of this institution has of late years attained a considerable degree of renown, and rightly so. Not only is Gregorian taught thoroughly, but also the classics of the Renaissance and the compositions of the ablest modern composers of church music receive a very fair share of well directed attention. Of all this a Benediction service, of which the music was partly Gregorian and partly figured, as well as a short musical programme, given by way of sacred concert, and consisting of selections from the works of Benz, Perosi, Croce, Palestrina and Philipps, were more than sufficient evidence. It was impossible to escape the conclusion that here at least a return to true religious music, in the same sense that His Holiness Pope Pius X. has since prescribed for the entire Catholic world, was most seriously intended, and, furthermore, that the seminary is not the last place where the foundation of such a reform can and ought to be laid.

No less edifying was the music at the Birmingham Cathedral itself. Here, too, everything was in absolute conformity with the musico-liturgical prescriptions of the Church. About the year 1850 the choir of St. Chad's became the recipient of a partial endowment, the fruition of which was to be dependent upon the following conditions: First, that certain parts of the Mass, such as the *Asperges*, the *Proprium Missae*, the *Credo*, *Sanctus* and *Benedictus*, should always be sung in Gregorian; secondly, that all figured music, sung at either High Mass or Vespers, be strictly ecclesiastical in character, and, thirdly, that compositions of this latter kind be such as not to render an accompaniment of either organ or other musical instruments indispensable. It was thus that the sacredness of the

music has been safeguarded in this church for over a half century, a fact which neither clergy nor laity have found reason to regret.

It is a well-known fact that while Catholic churches have, during the last three centuries, gradually turned their backs upon the productions of the Renaissance masters and have substituted therefor, as a rule, compositions such as should never have been tolerated in the house of the Lord, the same cannot be said of many Protestant churches, particularly the cathedrals of England. Here the traditions of the school founded by Tallis and Byrde have been tenaciously adhered to down to the present day. The music of these churches is, therefore, really devout and edifying to a degree that must seem almost incredible to one who has not himself been a witness to the fact. The writer will never forget the profound impression made upon him when in Oxford he was present for the first time at the evening service in Christ Church. The singing of the Psalms was truly enchanting. While the movement in the recitation of the sacred text was light and crisp, the effect was none the less that of a sincere, heartfelt prayer; and the accompaniment of the organ, now calm and subdued, now modestly swelling its tones, gave to the whole an air of religious solemnity such as is seldom to be found except amidst the sweet melodies of the traditional chant as sung by the Benedictine monks. The polyphonic doxology sung at the close of each Psalm seemed verily a foretaste of heaven, where choir vies with choir in giving glory to the Triune God. Even the plain reading of the lessons and prayers was deeply impressive, bearing ample testimony to the unfathomable sublimity of the liturgy of the Catholic Church in every, even in its most simple, part.

What has been said of the music of Christ Church is equally true of the music of numerous other Anglican churches, such as St. Paul's, Westminster Abbey and Chapel Royal, in London; the Cathedral of Ely and King's Chapel, in Cambridge. Nor must we imagine that the effectiveness of the music we have just described is due in any way to the massiveness of the choirs by which it is produced. As a matter of fact, the choir of Westminster, which is a fair example in this respect, consists of only six or eight men and a few more than twice that number of boys. The greatest care, however, is exercised in the selection and training, particularly of the boys' voices; and it is thus that these English cathedral choirs insure that purity and roundness of tone which has deservedly made them the object of almost universal admiration.

The writer had been in London but a very short time when his attention was repeatedly called to the magnificent performances of the choir of St. Philip's Oratory. Many non-Catholics, he was

told, frequented this church simply because of the beautiful music. One visit sufficed to convince him of the correctness of the information he had received. The choir consisted of a goodly number of well-trained singers, and was located, not in the chancel, as were those of the Anglican churches, but on a side gallery, where at least part of them could be conveniently seen from the body of the church. The Mass which was sung was one of wonderful pomp and splendor, and was rendered in a manner that would have done credit to a theatre of the very first rank. The congregation, which filled every seat down to the very door of the church, listened with the utmost attention, while the ministers at the altar sat patiently waiting.

But there is true church music in Catholic churches also in London, such as compares most favorably with that of Westminster Abbey and St. Paul's. The late Archbishop of Westminster, Cardinal Vaughan, anxious to restore in England the Catholic liturgy in its full splendor, some time before his death brought from Downside College the highly gifted and energetic Professor Terry, and appointed him choirmaster of the new Westminster Cathedral. Mr. Terry, who is an authority on the music of Byrde, the English Palestrina, immediately determined to make his choir the exponent of that master's works, hoping thus to excite amongst his Catholic countrymen a noble emulation of the glorious achievements of Catholic Englishmen of other times. That the efforts of Mr. Terry have thus far met with the greatest success is evident from the high renown which the choir of Westminster has already obtained. Even under the unfavorable conditions presented by the Pro-Cathedral, in which services were conducted until the opening of the Cathedral proper, some months ago, the effect of the music was one of calm religious serenity, truly worthy of the house of God.

It was at Westminster that the writer first became acquainted with the traditional Gregorian melodies rendered according to the method of Solesmes. The impression made upon him on that occasion was not, however, what he had anticipated. Having been thoroughly imbued with the principle that in Gregorian chant the accented syllables are practically long and are to be produced with a considerable impulse; and, furthermore, that the diamond-shaped notes, because short, are to be rendered rapidly, it was impossible for him to thoroughly appreciate these unruffled, passionless melodies. These subjective difficulties, however, gradually vanished when further opportunities of hearing the chant were afforded in the monastery of Farnborough, and particularly in the abbey of Appuldurcombe, I. of W., where the Benedictines of Solesmes are now in exile and of which we shall have more to say toward the end of this article.

It is a well-known fact that in several of the countries of continental Europe the work of a reform in church music has been prosecuted with admirable energy, especially during the last three or four decades. In Belgium, where a special school has been established to aid in this reform, the efforts thus far made have been crowned with well-merited success. Aside from Gregorian, which is cultivated assiduously, the music sung in the larger churches is almost exclusively that of the Cecilian school, that is, it is more or less an imitation of the masterpieces of the Renaissance, characterized by a liberal use of more modern harmonies; and the choirs, consisting of men and boys, and not unfrequently of men only, possess all the requisites for a dignified and devout rendering of this music.

At the Cathedral of Tournay the writer observed a little peculiarity in the execution of the Gregorian chant, one that he found again later on at the Cathedral of Malines. While the method used in both these churches was practically that which we have described above as the method of Ratisbon, the actual rendering was far more vigorous than is usually the case amongst those who belong to that school. The impression the chant made here was that of a sermon delivered with power and majesty, rather than that of a calm musical declamation. The vast difference between this method and that of Solesmes was evident from the very first moment; and the contrast became even more striking when opportunities were again afforded of hearing the traditional chant amongst the Benedictines of Louvain and Maredsous. The thought that arose spontaneously was that, if Malines made its watch-word "Sing as though you were preaching," and if Ratisbon proclaimed "Natural Declamation" the ultimate criterion of good chant, then "Sing as you pray" might rightly be given as the motto of Solesmes.

In fact, it is the character of simple, childlike prayer that marked the chant of the Benedictines everywhere. Particularly true, however, was this at Maredsous, Maria Laach, Beuron and Einsiedeln, where the fathers have larger churches, better adapted to choirs of seventy or eighty men. The long pauses at the asterisk in the Psalms, and the extreme precision especially in the responses, Psalms and hymns—things that seemed somewhat mechanical in smaller chapels—here produced a wonderful effect of self-denial and devotion; while the simple, scarcely audible accompaniment of the organ lent to the whole a charm such as must in time conquer even the most hostile.

Excepting the few remarks relative to Gregorian in Westminster, we have thus far spoken of the traditional chant in monasteries only. If thereby we have left the impression that this chant, which is now

to become once more the property of the Catholic world, was confined, even two years ago, to such institutions only, we must, before proceeding, correct this error. As a matter of fact, the theory and practice of the traditional melodies has been part of the course of the Fribourg University for some time, instructions in that branch being given by the now well-known Dr. P. Wagner. Short and more popular courses have also been given at various times by the monks at Beuron; while a great number of students of the chant, coming from all parts of the world, have profited by the kindness of the fathers of Solesmes. As to practical results, the boys' choir of Mr. Booth has long since made itself famous by its public illustrations of the chant, given in Liverpool and elsewhere. Even in Germany, where the spirit of opposition against Solesmes chant had long prevailed, at least the method of rendition gradually made considerable conquests.

Whenever of late years the question of reform in matters pertaining to church music has been raised, those who were unwilling to hear of a change have invariably appealed to the example of Italy, and especially to that of Rome. While it is true that the abuses have been as great there as in other parts of the world, it is also true that this fact was duly recognized by ecclesiastical authorities, and that at least in some instances the means were used to radically eliminate such abuses. The work done in this respect by the present Pope when still Patriarch of Venice is now too well known to require comment. At Loretto, too, and at the shrine of St. Anthony of Padua, the musical part of the services has for many years past been conducted with all requisite decorum, the care of the music in these churches having been intrusted to men specially trained at the school for church music in Ratisbon. In Rome the choir of the Anima, under the direction of Dr. Mueller, has been setting a good example for several decades, one that has not been altogether unproductive of good fruits, at least in some of the larger churches of the Eternal City.

The principal part, however, of the reform in Rome as well as elsewhere in Italy was, during all this time, going on in the ecclesiastical seminaries. It was felt that here the foundations of all permanent reform in this matter must be laid by imbuing the clergy of the future with a proper realization of what the music of the Church can and ought to be. Of the institutions of this kind in Rome the German College has for many years enjoyed the highest reputation for the truly ecclesiastical character of its music, but particularly for its exemplary execution of the Gregorian chant. The extraordinary zeal manifested by the students of many other Italian seminaries during the last two or three years is due in a

great measure to the introduction of the traditional melodies; and it can safely be said that this display of enthusiasm on the part of the seminarians contributed in no small degree to give confidence to Pope Pius X. in the reform he has undertaken with so much energy. Of the rapidity with which the traditional melodies were spreading amongst the institutions of which we are speaking at a time when the Ratisbon edition of the chant still retained its official character, an idea may be formed from the fact that at the close of the year 1902 no less than seven of the more important Roman colleges, such as the Collegio Capranico and the Seminario Vaticano, were actually making use of the Solesmes edition to the exclusion of all others.

"It is gratifying for us," says His Holiness in the "Motu Proprio" on church music, "to be able to acknowledge with real satisfaction the large amount of good that has been accomplished in this respect (the removal of abuses affecting sacred music) during the last decade in this our beloved city of Rome, and in many churches in our country, but in a more especial way among some nations in which illustrious men, full of zeal for the worship of God, have, with the approval of the Holy See and under the direction of their Bishops, united in flourishing societies and restored sacred music to the fullest honor in all their churches and chapels." Of the nations to which His Holiness here refers as the chief source of consolation to himself there can be no doubt that Germany is entitled to the very first place. The amount of work accomplished in the restoration of sacred song by the German Cecilian societies, to which the "Motu Proprio," without naming them, refers in a special way, can scarcely be overestimated. When, forty years ago, Dr. Witt, the founder of these societies, first began his campaign against the scandalous performances then in vogue, there were perhaps in all Germany not three churches whose music might have served as a model to the rest. To-day, on the contrary, it would not be a difficult task to give a long list of dioceses in that country in which a complete transformation has taken place, from the cathedral down to the last village church. Another evidence of the remarkable activity displayed in the circle of the German Cecilian societies is the fact that, while at the beginning of the reform movement there were but very few compositions deserving of recommendation, the catalogue of the "Allgemeiner Deutscher Caecilienverein" at present contains over three thousand such compositions, adapted to the requirements of every conceivable occasion, and accommodated to the ability of choirs of every degree of perfection.

Among the chief factors in the renovation of ecclesiastical music in Germany as well as in many other countries of both Europe and

America, the "Kirchenmusikschule" of Ratisbon occupies a most prominent place. This school, which was founded in 1874 by Dr. F. X. Haberl, a member of the Papal commission for the revision of the hitherto official chant, and by the Canons Dr. G. Jakob (July, 1903) and Michael Haller, has been the direct outcome of the needs of the times in the early days of the Cecilian movement. Some years before the agitation begun by Witt against the so-called church music of the eighteenth century, Louis I. of Bavaria, that ardent promoter of the fine arts, had brought about in the Cathedral of Ratisbon a revival of the classic polyphony of the Renaissance. Before long Ratisbon had become the Mecca of all church musicians, especially of those belonging to the Cecilian societies, and students flocked thither from all parts to hear the "Sistine Choir of Germany" and to profit by the hints they might receive from those who had been instrumental in accomplishing the work so nobly done. It was then that Dr. Haberl, at that time director of the Cathedral choir, and his two illustrious colleagues, in consideration of the inconvenience both to themselves and to those who came to consult them, of private and irregular instructions, determined to give for six months in each year a systematic course in all those matters which pertain in an especial manner to the directors of church choirs. From this school, which has now been conducted for over thirty years with an admirable spirit of self-denial, as the writer can attest from a personal experience of fully six months, and unremitting zeal for the decorum for the house of God, there have gone forth some of the ablest and most active laborers in the field of modern church music, such as have contributed in no small degree to determine the character of the "Motu Proprio" of Pope Pius X., particularly in its bearing on music of the figured style.

If we were to inquire for the secret of the astounding progress made in a few decades by the reform of church music under the auspices of the allied German Cecilian societies, we should find it to be primarily the principle adopted by them that in all matters pertaining to the sacred liturgy the prescriptions of the Church must be the first and last criterion of right and wrong. Of the fidelity of the Cecilians to this, their fundamental principle, a remarkable instance is afforded us at this very moment, when in dutiful submission to the Holy See they are about to accept formally a style of Gregorian chant of which they have been for many years the most powerful opponents.

Thus far we have spoken in a general way only of the achievements of the German Cecilian societies. Though an account of their works in detail as illustrated especially in the more important cathedral choirs would perhaps be interesting, yet we must refrain

from entering upon this task lest we be carried beyond the limits we have set for this article. In conclusion, however, of our remarks on Germany we would add that besides the cathedral choir of Ratisbon, which still maintains its superiority over all the rest, several other choirs of that city, and also the cathedral choirs of Muenster, Cologne, St. Gall and Brixen (the last two, though not in Germany, are affiliated with the "Allgemeiner Deutscher Caecilienverein") have attained such a degree of perfection as to compare, we believe, not unfavorably with the very best church choirs of England.

Elsewhere in this article, referring to the Abbey of Solesmes, temporarily transferred to Appuldurcombe, I. of W., we promised to return to this, the home of the Solesmes chant. We propose now, before bringing our article to a close, to keep this promise. Our object in reverting to this subject is to give a short sketch of the history of the Solesmes school, which, we believe, will be the more welcome, as it is this school that has recently been intrusted with the preparation of the prospective official edition of the traditional chant.

When during the first half of the last century Dom Prosper Guéranger had successfully restored in France the Benedictine order, suppressed by the Revolution, one of the problems that presented itself to him for solution was that of securing for the use of the monks a suitable edition of the liturgical chant. Discontented with the defective character of the books then commonly in use, he resolved to have recourse to the oldest, that is, the pneumatic manuscripts, in order to reproduce from them the original reading of the melodies of St. Gregory. To carry out this plan he deputed Dom Jausions and Dom Pothier, the latter at that time a novice of the order, to make a thorough study of the available Gregorian codices, laying down for their guidance the principle that whenever several manuscripts owing their origin to different countries and epochs were found to agree on a certain reading, this reading might safely be considered the authentic Gregorian melody. After twelve years of diligent labor on the part of these two men the *Liber Gradualis* was at last ready for the press. But fully twelve years more expired before it was placed in the hands of the publisher (1883), all this time having been spent by Dom Pothier, whom death had deprived of his collaborateur, in perfecting this work by further study and collating of manuscripts and in preparing that epoch-making book, "Les Mélodies Grégoriennes," which was to serve as an introduction to the new Gradual.

In spite of the great amount of care spent upon the preparation of the *Liber Gradualis*, the restoration of the chant of St. Gregory in

its primitive purity was not yet a *fait accompli*, as became evident when the new books were introduced into the monastery choir. On the one hand, the melodies themselves were still defective in many respects, owing to the insufficiency of the manuscripts placed at the disposal of Solesmes; on the other hand, the divisions of the melodies, made in some instances without sufficient regard to the codices, also left room for considerable emendation. To complete the work thus happily begun was the part reserved to the highly gifted and resolute Dom Mocquereau. Gathering around him a body of ten or fifteen talented young monks, he began by a publication in the *Paléographie Musicale* of manuscripts brought together from all parts of the world, to defend the Solesmes books against the attacks coming from the Ratisbon quarter, and to prove the substantial agreement of the manuscripts among themselves. This done, he next turned his attention to the eradication of the defects that still marred the work of his predecessors—a duty the more imperative at this moment, as many Bishops began to adopt the chant of Solesmes, and further delay would have revealed its defects to the uninitiated critics whose observation they had hitherto escaped. The publication of the *Paléographie Musicale* had occasioned a gigantic growth in the library of Solesmes, the photographic and manuscript reproductions of Gregorian codices being now actually numbered by the thousands. In order to make of this vast amount of material an instrument with which to work conveniently and securely, the readings of all these documents were arranged on synoptic tables in such a way that the history of any given phrase of the chant might be traced at a glance, and in case of variations the original reading might be determined with almost absolute certainty. That a proceeding such as this entailed an enormous amount of expense and persevering labor can readily be imagined; but it was the only scientific, the only completely satisfactory way of restoring the chant, which the Church had inherited from her saints, to the purity with which it first came forth from the “fountains of St. Gregory.”

JOHN M. PETER.

St. Bernard's Seminary, Rochester, N. Y.